

Avondale Estates

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Monday, May 3, 2010 - 7:00 p.m.

MINUTES

Members Present: Jim Glover, Chairman
Todd Pullen .
Doug Leckband
Patrick O'Connor

Staff Present: Juliette Sims-Owens, City Clerk
Monica Callahan, Consultant
Ken Kocher, Consultant

Item 1. Meeting called to order at 7:06 p.m. by Chairman Glover.

Item 2. Approval of Minutes

- February 1, 2010 - Regular Meeting
- March 1, 2010 - Regular Meeting
- March 24, 2010 - HPC/ARB Joint Work Session
- April 5, 2010 - Regular Meeting

A motion to approve the minutes as presented was made by Patrick O'Connor, seconded by Doug Leckband; passed with all ayes (4-0).

Item 3. Consent Agenda

- **69 Clarendon Avenue (Cromwell)**- Replace existing chain link fence with wooden fence,
- **37 Berkeley Road (Waters)** - Install double doors in place of windows on front porch.
- **25 Clarendon Avenue (Austin-Cruse)**- replace front stoop, steps and walkway with natural stone, replace stoop and steps at rear door with natural stone.
- **51 Dartmouth Avenue (Avondale Swim & Tennis – Craig Ball)** – Addition of Grill Area within pool area with concrete slab

Public comment: None

A motion to approve the consent agenda as presented was made by Todd Pullen, seconded by Doug Leckband; passed with all ayes (4-0).

Item 4. Old Business: None

Item 5. New Business:

- **151 Locust Street (AR Holdings LLC)** - porches: tempered safety glass and aluminum railings.

Board noted that the safety glass and aluminum railings have already been installed.

Applicant Ed Rieker, 151 Locust Street stated that he had brought the railings before the board when he submitted previously and the glass was put in when the board approved the deck previously.

Todd Pullen asked did the board specifically approve the glass and rails at that time.

Applicant Ed Rieker, 151 Locust Street stated that he did not think the materials were specifically discussed.

Chairman Glover stated that he did not remember the glass and aluminum rail that came before the board because it is not characteristic of the district.

Consultant Callahan stated that the board's obligation is the review the application as if it had not been done.

Applicant Ed Rieker, 151 Locust Street noted that there are a lot of things on the house that are not from when it was originally built.

Chairman Glover noted that the reason the applicant is here tonight is because this particular railing design was not specified in the certificate appropriateness that he received the approval for. Chairman Glover asked Consultant Callahan's for her recommendation.

Consultant Callahan stated that we are assuming at face value that the rails were deteriorating that are gone whether were historic or not. Chairman Glover stated they were not historic. Consultant Callahan noted that the board has their guidelines on rails and they have given latitude to one house that met the spirit but not the specific design and she feels this application does meet the spirit.

Chairman Glover stated that given the nature of the structure, which is the oldest house in Avondale and it has been updated quite extensively through the years, and since it is a commercial structure now and the nature of the business the board should give some latitude.

Patrick O'Connor noted his discontent as to why this application was even brought before the board.

Consultant Callahan stated the board has to look at this application as others is it compliant with the guidelines and the motion should be made in spirit of the board's guidelines.

Chairman Glover stated that the board has to look at it as something that can be restored back to an original look and not something that is not irreversible.

Consultant Callahan stated even though it uses an aluminum and glass design it still maintains an open framing appearance

Doug Leckband stated that he does not have a problem with the design of the rails what he has a problem with is that there are three railing types on the house (the original rod iron on the upper deck, the white aluminum on the porches and the wood hand rails on the ramp).

Applicant Ed Rieker, 151 Locust Street stated that the rod iron is starting to rot and that is a project for next year.

Consultant Callahan stated that she finds it okay that the ramp distinguishes itself because it tells you it is not part of historic houses. Consultant Callahan stated that ramps that try to mirror up to the houses gives them a bulkier feeling.

Todd Pullen stated that he does not feel the introduction of glass into the district is appropriate and is opening up a precedent that he is not ready to see.

Doug Leckband stated that he agrees with Todd and even though it is a very modern look and even though it is a very non-visible look it is a very modern look on a very historic house.

Consultant Callahan stated how different is that from an enclosed porch.

Todd Pullen stated that since he has been here there have been a lot of enclosed porches and is something he has come to accept that have predated him but glass railings have not predated him.

Consultant Callahan stated that if it was a full enclosure he would not feel the same way.

Todd Pullen stated correct, it would have a completely different look and does not remember seeing the tempered glass.

Patrick O'Connor stated how was the railing described in the original application.

Applicant Ed Rieker, 151 Locust Street stated he did not describe it at all it was just a deck in his last application and his first application was the handicap railing and the porch they had to put something up for safety reasons.

Board reviewed the original application.

Public Comment:

David Greenberg, 111 Berkeley stated that he uses the facility and it is very nice.

A motion to approve the application for 151 Locust Street as presented because the proposed railing is temporary in nature, can easily be replaced and is going on a commercial structure that is blocked enlarge part by a handicap ramp that also does not look anything like the structure and it has been there for over a year and two commissioners who live in the immediate vicinity of it never even noticed it, was made by Patrick O'Connor; seconded by Todd; passed with all ayes (4-0).

- **1 Lakeshore Drive (Parker)** - Add gable to shed roof on addition at back of the house, re-roof shed roof.

Public Comment: None

Board and applicants reviewed application.

The applicant confirmed that the steel roof will be on the entire back portion, shed and gable.

Doug Leckband noted to the applicant that the builder could prop the gable up a little to prop the header up and go with a standard door.

Consultant Callahan stated that should be noted in the file that the intention is to break the fascia. Doug Leckband noted the file and the applicant initialed.

A motion to approve the addition of the gable roof and the re-roofing as submitted for 1 Lakeshore Drive was made by Doug Leckband; seconded by Todd Pullen; passed with all ayes (4-0).

- **111 Berkeley Road (Greenberg/Starcher)** - Rear yard fence.

Public Comment: None

Chairman Glover noted on the application that there will be a matching gate on the fence.

A motion to approve the application as submitted for 111 Berkeley Road with a wood rail fence not to exceed 6 feet on the side yard and wire fencing to match the original was made by Doug Leckband; seconded by Todd Pullen; passed with all ayes (4-0).

Item 6. Other items deemed appropriate for discussion

Doug Leckband introduced David Sacks of 89 Berkeley Road who is interested in filling the open board position. Doug noted that the applicant is a landscape architect. The board gave an overview of the board responsibilities to Mr. Sacks. Mr. Sacks will complete a board application and forward it to City Clerk Owens. Mr. Sacks asked the City Clerk to forward to him copies of the guidelines and ordinances. The Board asked the City Clerk to add this board applicant to the Board of Mayor and Commissioners next work session for discussion then approval.

Board discussed 95 Berkeley Road which was approved at last months meeting. Applicant has additional items that he would like to add to his submission. Board reviewed the items and noted that the applicant will need to submit another application for those additional items but he could submit a permit authorization for the items that were approved at last months meeting.

Board discussed grant opportunities. Consultants Callahan and Kocher will look into submitting a survey grant for the board.

Item 7. Adjournment

There being no further business, a motion to adjourn at 8:11 p.m. was made by Todd Pullen, seconded by Doug Leckband, passed with all ayes (4-0).

Approved this 7th day of June, 2010

Jim Glover, Chairman