

Abondale Estates

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

May 13, 2009 – 7:00 p.m.

Minutes

Members Present: Jim Glover, Chairman
Doug Leckband
Chris Kingsbury
Todd Pullen
Patrick O'Connor

Staff Present: Juliette Sims-Owens, City Clerk
Monica Callahan, Consultant

Item 1. Meeting called to order at 7:05 p.m. by Chairman Glover

Item 2. Consent Agenda
➤ **101 Clarendon Avenue** (Stewart): Finish out interior attic space, restructure rear roof line

Public Comment: None

A motion to approve the consent agenda was made by Todd Pullen, seconded by Patrick O'Connor; passed with all ayes (5-0).

Item 3. Old Business:
➤ **5 Exeter Road** (Leckband): Construction of new garage and driveway.

Chairman Glover gave an overview of the review of the application of 5 Exeter. Chairman Glover noted that at the last meeting the board tabled the application to give the neighbors a chance to review the revised site plans.

Mr. Leckband formally recused himself from the board and noted that he is the applicant for this application.

Public Comment:

James Girard, 9 Exeter Road, stated that he is also the owner of 7 Exeter. Mr. Girard noted that he has reviewed the revised plans for 5 Exeter and he wanted to review a few things that he would like the board to consider. Mr. Girard noted the following:

- (1) It is s a huge garage for the lot but if it meets the zoning ordinance, then he does not have a problem with it.
- (2) There is a 3ft. to 4ft. driveway encroachment onto the property of 7 Exeter and in the original plans of 5 Exeter they were going to rebuild the driveway and presumably get it off the property of 7 Exeter and Mr. Girard asked if that will still occur. Chairman Glover stated yes that will still occur.
- (3) Mr. Girard noted that there is an ongoing drainage issue. Mr. Girard stated that most of the water that comes from the rear of the Leckband property hits their driveway and cascades down onto the driveway of 7 Exeter. Mr. Girard stated that he hopes the drainage issue will be addressed. Mr. Leckband noted that he will be putting down concrete and doing an interior swail on it. Mr. Girard stated that should work, he would like to keep the water off of 7 Exeter.
- (4) Mr. Girard stated that because of the size of the structure he would request that the side yard setback adjacent to 7 Exeter be pushed to 10 ft. as opposed to 5 ft. Mr. Girard stated that he knows the ordinance says 5 ft. Chairman Glover stated that it is not a Historic Preservation Commission matter that is a Board of Appeals matter because the existing structure plan as submitted falls within the zoning ordinance. Chairman Glover stated that Mr. Girard would have to bring his grievance to the Board of Appeals. Mr. Girard asked the applicant, Mr. Leckband to consider a 10 ft. setback because of the height of the structure.
- (5) Mr. Girard asked that the mechanical units be put to the rear of the structure as opposed to the side. Mr. Leckband noted that at this time there is no plan for mechanical units. Mr. Girard asked whenever there is a plan he asked that they be put to the rear of the structure as opposed to the side.
- (6) Mr. Girard asked Mr. Leckband if he would be removing the large oak tree in the back. Mr. Leckband stated no. Chairman Glover noted that one of the stipulations for placing the building where it is was to preserve the tree.

A motion to approve the application of 5 Exeter Road as presented was made by Patrick O'Connor, seconded by Chris Kingsbury; passed with all ayes (4-0).

Item 4. New Business:

- **25 Kensington Road** (Hutchens): Tier Change

Public Comment: None

A motion to approve the tier change at 25 Kensington Road from preservation to conservation for the reasons stated by the applicant (i.e. badly leaking roof and badly situated dormers that provide no light to the second story) was made by Chris Kingsbury, seconded by Todd Pullen; passed with all ayes (5-0).

- **31 Berkeley Road** (Chafin): Replace/Widen driveway, Relay front walk, Relay back patio with walkway to garage, re-screen side porch with fixed windows around the bottom.

Public Comment:

Neighbor noted that they are in agreement with the plan to give the applicants daughter room to park.

A motion to approve the application of 31 Berkeley as presented with the option of laying the existing flagstone as just stepping stones if the applicant so chooses was made by Todd Pullen, seconded by Doug Leckband; passed with all ayes (5-0).

- **74 Lakeshore Drive** (Galpin): New second floor and rear additions

Public Comment: None

A motion to approve the application of 74 Lakeshore Drive with the verifications that the siding is going to be less than 6" lap siding/ smooth hardiplank, outdoor fireplace on the 2nd floor is not very prominent or visible due to the elevation was made by Todd Pullen, seconded by Patrick O'Connor; passed with all ayes (5-0).

- **28 Lakeshore Drive** (Toniolo): Partial picket fence and partial gated picket fence on both sides of the home attached to the rear sides and connecting to existing chain link fence.

Public Comment: None

A motion to approve the application of 28 Lakeshore Drive given the conditions that the fence does not exceed 6 ft. and the columns can be scalped or straight was made by Todd Pullen, seconded by Doug Leckband; passed with all ayes (5-0).

- **51 Dartmouth Avenue** - Avondale Swim & Tennis - Trophy Room (Ball): Remove existing double door to cased opening, remove 2 windows for 12' cased opening, modify/enlarge existing deck

Public Comment: None

A motion to approve the application of 51 Dartmouth as presented was made by Doug Leckband, seconded by Patrick O'Connor; passed with all ayes (5-0).

Item 5. Other items deemed appropriate for discussion.

- Board discussion regarding the moving of the barn at 19 Dartmouth Avenue to another residence within Avondale Estates

Doug Leckband asked how the board feels as a committee about relocating a historic structure to a different property since it was originally part of another property. Mr. Leckband noted that 21 Dartmouth is considering tearing down their existing garage and moving the barn to that location. Mr. Leckband questioned if the barn is moved does it lose its historic value.

Consultant Callahan noted that typically when you move a historic structure from a historic property it does lose significance however, if a structure is not going to be saved and it is going to be moved off site it is best that it is not the primary structure which it is not in this case. It can also be relocated to a property that is associated with property or a property similar in context, or somewhere within the district.

Doug Leckband spoke about possibly changing the doors and the look of the barn once it is moved.

Chairman Glover stated that if Mr. Leckband is talking about changing the doors and changing the look of the barn then he is defeating the purpose of moving it in the first place. Chairman Glover stated that he would rather it sustain its originally significance as a shed or something like that.

Consultant Callahan stated that what the applicant should consider is how it is oriented. It would still be viewed as a barn because it has a man door but perhaps but vehicles could come into it from the side or the rear so that it still looks like a barn.

Jim Mahaffey, 19 Dartmouth Avenue stated that he really does not think the person interested in the barn wants to turn it into a garage from the conversations he has had with her due to the significant work that would need to be done in order to do that.

Chairman Glover stated that the board needs to have a work session to discuss if the board wants to keep the preservation homes they have to find ways for those homes to accommodate the renovations that are dictated by today's standard of living and present a recommendation to the Board of Mayor and Commissioners.

Consultant Callahan stated that her encouragement to the board is for a conservation district not a preservation district.

Doug Leckband stated that he is concerned about the number of structures within the district that are being allowed to deteriorate. Chairman Glover stated that he has called code enforcement a number of times regarding homes that were in neglect and he encouraged other board members to do the same to alert them of the homes that are in dilapidated conditions. Mr. Leckband spoke about the board renewing the windshield survey and then presenting it to the Board of Mayor and Commissioners. Chairman Glover asked that these issues be put on the work session agenda.

It was the consensus of the board to have a HPC Special Called Work Session, June 24th at 7:00 p.m.

Doug Leckband noted that there will be a Board of Mayor and Commissioners Joint LEED Ordinance Work Session, June 11th at 6:30 p.m. with the following boards: Downtown Development Authority, Planning and Zoning Board, Environmental Committee, Architectural Review Board, and Historic Preservation Commission.

Item 6. Adjournment

There being no further business, a motion to adjourn at 8:27 p.m. was made by Todd Pullen, seconded by Patrick O'Connor; passed with all ayes (5-0).

Next scheduled HPC meeting will be June 1, 2009 at 7:00 p.m.

Applications due Friday, May 15, 2009 at 12:00 noon